



**THE STATES assembled on Wednesday
15th September 2010, at 09.30 a.m. under
the Presidency of the Bailiff,
Michael Cameron St. John Birt Esquire.**

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Terence John Le Main – ill
Connétable Juliette Gallichan of St. Mary – excused attendance
Deputy Roy George Le Hérisier of St. Saviour – absent on States business
Deputy Shona Pitman of St. Helier – ill
Deputy Kevin Charles Lewis of St. Saviour – absent on States business

Prayers

Documents presented or laid

Property and Infrastructure Regeneration: the States of Jersey Development Company Limited (P.73/2010) – amendment (P.73/2010 Amd.) – comments. P.73/2010.
Presented: 15th September 2010. Amd.Com.
Council of Ministers.

Withdrawal of lodged propositions

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), the proposers of the following propositions lodged “au Greffe” had informed the Greffier of the States that they had been withdrawn –

Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 (P.99/2010): seventh amendment (paragraphs 4 and 5). P.99/2010.
Lodged: 24th August 2010. Amd.(7)
Senator B.E. Shenton.

Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 (P.99/2010): eighth amendment (paragraph 1). P.99/2010.
Lodged: 24th August 2010. Amd.(8)
Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel.

Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 P.99/2010

THE STATES resumed consideration of paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 (P.99/2010) and an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment 4, paragraph 3).

THE STATES rejected the amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment 4, paragraph 3) that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the **Economic Development Department** shall be increased by £183,000 in order to maintain support for the provision of school milk and not proceed with the Comprehensive Spending Review proposal on page 62 of the Plan EDS-13 “Cease funding to subsidise the provision of school milk” and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department shall be decreased by the same amount by reducing the allocation for Restructuring Costs.”

Members voted as follows –

POUR: 14

Senator A. Breckon
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. John
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

CONTRE: 30

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

ABSTAIN: 0

Following the rejection of paragraph 3 of the amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment 4, paragraph 3), the Deputy Bailiff informed the Assembly that paragraph 4 of the same amendment was deemed to have been withdrawn.

Senator James Leslie Perchard declared an interest and withdrew from the Chamber during consideration of the amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment 4, paragraph 3) to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 (P.99/2010).

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment 4, paragraph 2) to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011, that after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the **Economic Development Department** shall be decreased by £400,000 in order to reduce the level of support for Jersey Finance Limited and not proceed with the Comprehensive Spending Review proposal on page 62 of the Plan ED-S8 “Additional support for JFL”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 23

Senator B.E. Shenton
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator A. Breckon
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
 Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

CONTRE: 25

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)

ABSTAIN: 0

In accordance with Standing Order 106(1)(b) Deputy Ian Joseph Gorst of St. Helier declared an interest but remained in the Chamber for the duration of the debate.

THE STATES rejected an amendment of the Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel (Amendment 8, paragraph 2), that in paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan, after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the **Education, Sport and Culture Department** shall be increased by £88,000 in order maintain the post of Educational Psychologist and not proceed with the Comprehensive Spending Review proposal on page 62 of the Plan ESC-S3 (‘Restructuring the Special Educational Needs Service and the way emotional and behavioural support is delivered to primary school children’) and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department shall be decreased by the same amount by reducing the allocation for Restructuring Costs.”

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 13

Senator A. Breckon
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

CONTRE: 33

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

ABSTAIN: 0

THE STATES rejected an amendment of the Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel (Amendment 8, paragraph 3) that in paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan, after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the **Education, Sport and Culture Department** shall be increased by £33,000 in order maintain the annual payment to Durrell to allow free entry and teaching time for school parties and not proceed with the Comprehensive Spending Review proposal on page 62 of the Plan ESC-S5 (‘Cease annual payment to Durrell to allow free entry and teaching time for school parties’) and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department shall be decreased by the same amount by reducing the allocation for Restructuring Costs.”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 14

Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator A. Breckon
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

CONTRE: 31

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

ABSTAIN: 1

Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment 2) to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 that, after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the **Education Sport and Culture Department** shall be increased by £67,000 in order to maintain the level of modern foreign language assistants in secondary schools and not proceed with that element of the Comprehensive Spending Review proposal on page 62 of the Plan ESC-S4 “Re-defining core business for schools and colleges at ESC” and the net revenue expenditure of the Treasury and Resources Department shall be decreased by the same amount by reducing the allocation for restructuring costs.”

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 20

Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator F.E. Cohen

CONTRE: 25

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier

ABSTAIN: 1

Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)

Senator A. Breckon
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
 Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
 Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

THE STATES rejected an amendment of Deputy Trevor Mark Pitman of St Helier (Amendment 12) that in paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011, after the words “withdrawn from the consolidated fund in 2011” there should be inserted the words –

“except that the net revenue expenditure of the **Education, Sport and Culture Department** shall be increased by £50,000 to maintain the overall budget of the Youth Service (notwithstanding the saving that will be made through the restructuring of the senior management of the Youth Service as part of the Comprehensive Spending Review (ESC-S7))”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 12

Senator A. Breckon
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy D.J. De Sousa (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

CONTRE: 33

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf
 Senator F.E. Cohen
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. John

ABSTAIN: 0

Connétable of St. Saviour
Connétable of St. Clement
Connétable of St. Peter
Connétable of St. Lawrence
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
Deputy of St. Martin
Deputy of St. Ouen
Deputy of Grouville
Deputy of St. Peter
Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
Deputy of Trinity
Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
Deputy of St. John
Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)

Changes in Presidency

THE STATES re-assembled after the lunch adjournment under the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff during consideration of the amendment of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier (Amendment 4, paragraph 2) to paragraph (a) of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 (P.99/2010).

Arrangement of public business for the current meeting

THE STATES rejected a proposition of the Deputy of St. Peter that the Assembly should meet until 7.30 p.m. when it reconvened the following day.

Adjournment

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Thursday 16th September 2010 to continue consideration of the Draft Annual Business Plan 2011 (P.99/2010) and the outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 6.38 p.m.

M.N. DE LA HAYE

Greffier of the States